City o	f York	Council
--------	--------	---------

Committee Minutes

Meeting Audit & Governance Committee

Date 30 April 2018

Present Councillors Derbyshire (Chair), Lisle,

Shepherd, Cuthbertson, Fenton, Steward and D Taylor (Substitute for Councillor Kramm) Mr Mann and Mr Mendus (Independent

Members)

Apologies Councillor Kramm

[As amended at the meeting of 26 July 2018]

65. Declarations of Interest

Members were asked to declare any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interests which they may have in respect of business on the agenda. None were declared.

66. Public Participation

It was reported that there had been five registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme. The Chair advised all public speakers that they should avoid saying anything defamatory or discriminatory, anything that constitute a personal attack on an officer or anything that discloses confidential or exempt information including personal information.

Councillor Mark Warters, a Member of the Council, spoke on his concerns at the delay in publishing the report into the conduct of the Audit & Governance Committee on 22 February 2017 and asked for a full public disclosure of the report. He also raised further concerns in relation to historic procurement issues, which in his opinion have not been properly clarified and resolved.

Mr Laverack, a resident, spoke about a lack of transparency and his concerns that Freedom of Information requests are not dealt with *properly* and that *residents' emails and social media communication* have been blocked on social media. From his point of view residents with legitimate concerns are vilified and

claims of defamation or discrimination are wrongly brought up. He also stressed that historic issues can and should be revisited by councillors until completely resolved.

Mr Hammill, a resident, also spoke on transparency issues and his feeling that it has been attempted to scare him off with legal threats of defamation and discrimination. He stated that residents should have a right to question the Council and urged the Committee to deal with these issues. He also raised concerns of the council funding legal advice on officer's personal reputation claims.

Mr Fisher, a resident, spoke in relation to Members' right of access to information. He suggested that Members should have the right to access any information held by the Council of which they are a Member, although they may be asked to sign a confidentiality agreement. He also stated that they should receive all necessary papers within the usual statutory deadline of 5 working days ahead of the meeting. He also raised a potential conflict between sessions in private and the rights of all members of the council to stay in meetings after press and public are excluded.

Ms Swinburn, a resident, spoke on her concerns that Members had yet to receive the unredacted report into the conduct of the Audit & Governance committee on 22 February 2017. She felt this showed a lack of trust between Officers and Members. Finally, she stated that this was a report written by a consultant and, as such, she felt it should not be titled an 'LGA report'.

67. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the meetings held on 7 February and 11 April be approved and then signed by the Chair as a correct record, subject to the following amendments:

7 February 2018:

49. In response to a member question it was explained that, like many other local authorities, CYC employed an external audit a treasury management provider.

50. Veritau Mazars officers were in attendance to present the report and to respond to queries.

The auditor explained that a change to reporting deadlines would lead to an increase in incomplete audits reported in quarterly interim reports but members were reassured that audits would still be conducted to time.

53. It was explained that work was being doing doing to complete one comprehensive spreadsheet of all the Council's corporate and commercial premises, and to ensure appropriate surveys were completed of all properties.

68. Exclusion of Press and Public

Members expressed their disappointment that they had not yet received an unredacted version of the report (Annex A to Agenda Item 5). They stated they did not believe it was acceptable, or appropriate, for them to be asked to consider the full list of recommendations, or to make further recommendations, without having had advance sight of the report.

The committee also noted It was also suggested by Members that this report should be referred to ask the Walker Report after the consultant who wrote it. renamed ahead of the next meeting as-They did not consider this an LGA report as Ms Linda Walker had only been asked by the LGA after being asked by the Council's Chief Executive to carry out the investigation.

Resolved: That Item 5 (minute Item 69) be deferred to a future meeting of the Audit & Governance committee, with the unredacted report being shared with Members of the Committee no less *than* 5 working days prior to the meeting.

A special meeting of the Audit and Governance Committee to be convened as soon as possible, where the report can be considered by the committee in private session. Reason: To allow Members to fully consider the report and

the recommendations ahead of discussing the item

in private session.

69. Observations and Learning from the LGA Review into the Conduct of the Audit and Governance Committee on 22nd February 2017

This item was deferred to a future meeting of the Audit and Governance Committee (date TBC). See minute item 68.

Councillor Derbyshire, Chair [The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 5.55 pm].